

Peer - Reviewed & Refereed Journal

The Law Journal strives to provide a platform for discussion of International as well as National Developments in the Field of Law.

DISCLAIMER

No part of this publication may be reproduced or copied in any form by any means without prior written permission of Editor-in-chief of White Black Legal

— The Law Journal. The Editorial Team of White Black Legal holds the

- The Law Journal. The Editorial Team of White Black Legal holds the copyright to all articles contributed to this publication. The views expressed in this publication are purely personal opinions of the authors and do not reflect the views of the Editorial Team of White Black Legal. Though all efforts are made to ensure the accuracy and correctness of the information published, White Black Legal shall not be responsible for any errors caused due to oversight or otherwise.

EDITORIAL TEAM

Raju Narayana Swamy (IAS) Indian Administrative Service officer



a professional Procurement from the World Bank.

Dr. Raju Narayana Swamy popularly known as Kerala's Anti Corruption Crusader is the All India Topper of the 1991 batch of the IAS and posted currently as Principal Secretary to the Government of Kerala . He has earned many accolades as he hit against the political-bureaucrat corruption nexus in India. Dr Swamy holds a B.Tech in Computer Science and Engineering from the IIT Madras and a Ph. D. in Cyber Law from Gujarat National Law University . He also has an LLM (Pro) (with specialization in IPR) as well as three PG Diplomas from the National Law University, Delhione in Urban Environmental Management and Law, another in Law Environmental and Policy and third one in Tourism and Environmental Law. He also holds a post-graduate diploma IPR from the National Law School, Bengaluru and diploma Public in

Dr. R. K. Upadhyay

Dr. R. K. Upadhyay is Registrar, University of Kota (Raj.), Dr Upadhyay obtained LLB, LLM degrees from Banaras Hindu University & Phd from university of Kota.He has successfully completed UGC sponsored M.R.P for the work in the ares of the various prisoners reforms in the state of the Rajasthan.



Senior Editor



Dr. Neha Mishra

Dr. Neha Mishra is Associate Professor & Associate Dean (Scholarships) in Jindal Global Law School, OP Jindal Global University. She was awarded both her PhD degree and Associate Professor & Associate Dean M.A.; LL.B. (University of Delhi); LL.M.; Ph.D. (NLSIU, Bangalore) LLM from National Law School of India University, Bengaluru; she did her LL.B. from Faculty of Law, Delhi University as well as M.A. and B.A. from Hindu College and DCAC from DU respectively. Neha has been a Visiting Fellow, School of Social Work, Michigan State University, 2016 and invited speaker Panelist at Global Conference, Whitney R. Harris World Law Institute, Washington University in St.Louis, 2015.

Ms. Sumiti Ahuja

Ms. Sumiti Ahuja, Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, University of Delhi,

Ms. Sumiti Ahuja completed her LL.M. from the Indian Law Institute with specialization in Criminal Law and Corporate Law, and has over nine years of teaching experience. She has done her LL.B. from the Faculty of Law, University of Delhi. She is currently pursuing Ph.D. in the area of Forensics and Law. Prior to joining the teaching profession, she has worked as Research Assistant for projects funded by different agencies of Govt. of India. She has developed various audio-video teaching modules under UGC e-PG Pathshala programme in the area of Criminology, under the aegis of an MHRD Project. Her areas of interest are Criminal Law, Law of Evidence, Interpretation of Statutes, and Clinical Legal Education.



Dr. Navtika Singh Nautiyal

Dr. Navtika Singh Nautiyal presently working as an Assistant Professor in School of law, Forensic Justice and Policy studies at National Forensic Sciences University, Gandhinagar, Gujarat. She has 9 years of Teaching and Research Experience. She has completed her Philosophy of Doctorate in 'Intercountry adoption laws from Uttranchal University, Dehradun' and LLM from Indian Law Institute, New Delhi.





Associate Professor at School of Law, Apex University, Jaipur, M.A, LL.M, Ph.D,

Dr. Rinu have 5 yrs of teaching experience in renowned institutions like Jagannath University and Apex University. Participated in more than 20 national and international seminars and conferences and 5 workshops and training programmes.

Dr. Nitesh Saraswat

E.MBA, LL.M, Ph.D, PGDSAPM

Currently working as Assistant Professor at Law Centre II, Faculty of Law, University of Delhi. Dr. Nitesh have 14 years of Teaching, Administrative and research experience in Renowned Institutions like Amity University, Tata Institute of Social Sciences, Jai Narain Vyas University Jodhpur, Jagannath University and Nirma University.

More than 25 Publications in renowned National and International Journals and has authored a Text book on Cr.P.C and Juvenile Delinquency law.



Introduction of the second of

Subhrajit Chanda

BBA. LL.B. (Hons.) (Amity University, Rajasthan); LL. M. (UPES, Dehradun) (Nottingham Trent University, UK); Ph.D. Candidate (G.D. Goenka University)

Subhrajit did his LL.M. in Sports Law, from Nottingham Trent University of United Kingdoms, with international scholarship provided by university; he has also completed another LL.M. in Energy Law from University of Petroleum and Energy Studies, India. He did his B.B.A.LL.B. (Hons.) focussing on International Trade Law.

ABOUT US

WHITE BLACK LEGAL is an open access, peer-reviewed and refereed journal providededicated to express views on topical legal issues, thereby generating a cross current of ideas on emerging matters. This platform shall also ignite the initiative and desire of young law students to contribute in the field of law. The erudite response of legal luminaries shall be solicited to enable readers to explore challenges that lie before law makers, lawyers and the society at large, in the event of the ever changing social, economic and technological scenario.

With this thought, we hereby present to you

IN-DEPTH EXAMINATION OF THE BOOK, INDIAN SUFFRAGETTES BY SUMITA MUKHERJEE

AUTHORED BY – SAPNA INDU PILLAI

5th Year Law School Student
University – O.P Jindal Global University

In the book, Sumita Mukherjee covers various aspects of the Indian Suffragettes campaigns that took place with its transnational connections and relevance in today's time. The author deeply talks about not just the campaigns but also "intimately intertwined transnational and international nature of the women's movement and suffrage campaigns around the world".

One of the major claims of the author throughout the book becomes about how the suffragettes movement was not motivated and wholly influenced by "western concerns" and that it was a common misconception because of various instances that did not highlight the movement and she substantiates this claim by showing how the suffragette campaign was failed as their concerns were never brought up during the Round Table Conference during 1930 and 1932 in which the women were very much involved in the discussions before the conference and highlighted the concern of the unavailability to vote or their political representation yet the women's representation question was conveniently brushed under the carpet and the conference became about power dynamics between the two states involved. The author also talks about how it is in instances such as these of complete ignorance and deprioritising of the women's movement in India which has led several to believe that there truly was no movement and that if there was one, it was a simulation of the western movement which is untrue.

The author also concentrates that on the relationship shared between the empire and the Indian women and also talks about the relationship and similarities and dissimilarities between British

¹ Sumita Mukherjee, *'Indian Suffragettes: Female Identities and Transnational Networks'* (2018), Oxford University Press, 2.

² ibid, 6.

³ ibid, 210.

⁴ Sumita Mukherjee, *'Indian Suffragettes: Female Identities and Transnational Networks'* (2018), Oxford University.

women and Indian women in the 20th century and how the British women thought themselves to be better than Indian women and claimed it to be their "imperial burden" to save these colonized women yet they are themselves oppressed by similar structures.⁶ The author states that even though the Indian suffragettes were keenly involved and connected in global networks and were a form of "subaltern networks of resistance" they did not take too kindly to the idea of feminism and rejected from calling themselves feminist. They instead concentrated on concepts such as womanhood and made strong bonds through friendships with one another, be it intimate of professional in nature. ⁸ According to the book, women in the movement were constrained to the private sphere and that they were a part of the national movement but were in a lot of ways restricted to private spaces. ⁹The book goes into depth about the struggles and challenges the women's movement had to go through to get political power at provision and national levels and how the first demand to vote came about in 1917 when the viceroy of India (Chelmsford) came but they only started getting enfranchised only in 1920s very regionally and slowing. ¹⁰ The author talks about how communal politics and representation also was a major issue that the suffragette movement had to phase. The division of quotas based on religion which was finally decided between The Muslim league and The Indian National Congress which became the priority of the nation as oppose to the upliftment on women politically. ¹¹ The author also goes into detail regarding how women were asked to hold "auxiliary" roles during the nationalist movements as instructed by Gandhi which was spinning khadi and picketing liquor stores and chores related to the private sphere primarily the home. ¹³The presence of Indian women in the London conference also proves that feminism in itself was just not a western effort but was highly influenced and constructed by colonized women and their experiences as well. After 1947 with the separation of India and Pakistan the issue of the women's question took a back seat and was not recognised.¹⁴

The book also analyses the need for post - colonial rethinking as a lot of the experiences faced by

_

⁵ ibid, 29.

⁶ ibid, 29.

⁷ ibid, 9.

⁸ Sumita Mukherjee, 'Indian Suffragettes: Female Identities and Transnational Networks' (2018), Oxford University.

⁹ Sumita Mukherjee, *'Indian Suffragettes: Female Identities and Transnational Networks'* (2018), Oxford University.

¹⁰ ibid, 27.

¹¹ Sumita Mukherjee, 'Indian Suffragettes: Female Identities and Transnational Networks' (2018), Oxford University.

¹² ibid, 20.

¹³ ibid.

¹⁴Sumita Mukherjee, *'Indian Suffragettes: Female Identities and Transnational Networks'* (2018), Oxford University.

the Indian suffragettes are either unrecognised or put under an umbrella of western experiences which is not the case. This claim by Sumita Mukherjee can be supported by a text from Ranta Kapur in which she states how it is deeply problematic to expect colonised and marginalised sections of societies to just accept the liberal view as the need of the liberal view to be a universal one tends to be exclusive in its nature. ¹⁵ This further states how it becomes difficult to identify the faults with the liberal view point because of its wide appeal to masses that benefit and exploit it and how the disadvantageous are easily identified by the oppressed classes facing the wrath of the view point, and that Ranta Kapur further goes on to explain how the need for a commonality and universality of experiences in order to have a homogenous future tends to be always dominated by the western story and this need futile need would not lead to emancipation of the masses as only selective tales of regionalised experiences are being heard and dealt with. ¹⁶

The book also addresses the impact of the Common Wealth on India and the suffragette movement by claiming that the campaigns in India were highly influenced by the earlier enfranchisement of New Zealand and Australia and their need to be equal to them in terms of rights. ¹⁷ The movement also empathised with their colonial counterparts in areas like Kenya and South Africa thereby bridging transitional narratives. Sumita Mukherjee calls this sort of feminism "colonial feminism" because of its singularity in terms of the narrative related to colonialism and concentrating exclusively on that. ¹⁹ The book also goes into grave details on how the issue of race was something that the Indian suffragette movement refused to engage with. ²⁰This is surprising considering the fact that India was facing discrimination due to oppressive structures such as caste which the British for the most part did not involve themselves with and neither did the movement. The book also looks into how a selective type of women from the Indian suffragette movement who was educated and well brought up was welcomed into conversations with the white dominated nations where as majority of the women were simply ignored. ²¹ This becomes interesting as even though the Indian Suffragette movement was trying to aim towards being

-

¹⁵ Ratna Kapur, "New Cosmologies: Mapping the Postcolonial Feminist Legal Project," in *Erotic justice: Law and the New Politics of Postcolonialism* (2005)

¹⁶ Ratna Kapur, "New Cosmologies: Mapping the Postcolonial Feminist Legal Project," in *Erotic justice: Law and the New Politics of Postcolonialism* (2005),21.

¹⁷ Sumita Mukherjee, *'Indian Suffragettes: Female Identities and Transnational Networks'* (2018), Oxford University, 78.

¹⁸ ibid.

¹⁹ ibid.

²⁰ Sumita Mukherjee, *'Indian Suffragettes: Female Identities and Transnational Networks'* (2018), Oxford University.

²¹ ibid, 80.

unified and having their concerns about being marginalised heard they chose to ignore questions of race and the injustices caused to people because of it and I believe that the text does not delve into that irony in depth. The book also sheds light on how there was a Eastern collective of women that came together during the Asian Relations Conference which was inaugurated by Nehru which saw women from many places such as India, Malaysia, Egypt, Iran, Korea etc emphasising on conversations on women's rights internationally which was a welcomed change from the usual conversations that were centred around the West ideals and they were able to identify the difference in situations as the women's question in Asia centred around "political and economic upheavals" 22

The book in one of its five segments addresses the relationship between the suffragettes campaign and nationalism in which it discusses the three important women's organisations that existed during the 1930's namely the AIWC, the NCWI and the WIA and how it was impossible for these organisations to talk about the women's movement without also talking or engaging in the nationalist movement because of how interlinked the two movements were and gives examples on how women faced police brutality and imprisonment and how this played out in the larger anti colonial movement that was taking place giving various instances were these complex relationships were highlighted.²³

The epilogue of the book finally discusses the Indians women's movement post- independence and shares details on how even though the movement was majorly constituted of upper - class women but the group that campaigned for female vote was a very mixed crowd of identities. ²⁴ It also sheds light of the quota system debate and provides statistical information regarding the participation of women in politics and how its increased throughout the years and also looks into how the question of participation was silent during the 1950s and 1960s and rose again during conversations about the panchayat system and the lack of women in the panchayat and village system. ²⁵ The book ends by highlighting various historic moments of where the women's movement was truly undeniable in India for example during the 2013 rape case how there was a unity like never before and how even internationally with Indian women's movement has shown strength for example when Donald Trump became the US President a march for organised

_

²² ibid, 191.

²³ ibid, 198.

²⁴ ibid, 245.

²⁵ Ibid. 247.

showing dissent and how it is important to recognise the uniqueness and importance of the Indian Suffragettes movements place and positive contribution to world history and politics. ²⁶



²⁶ ibid, 251.